

MINUTES

**Historic Preservation Commission
First Floor Community Development Conference Rooms
7447 E. Indian School Road
December 9, 2004
5:00 P.M.**

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 5:04 P.M.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Ed Wimmer, Chair
B.J. Gonzales, Vice Chair
Nancy Dallett, Commissioner
George Hartz, Commissioner
Cathy Johnson, Commissioner
Kathy Howard, Commissioner
Paul Winslow, Commissioner

Staff: Don Meserve
Debbie Abele, HPO

Visitors: Gloria Argueso, Alice Ruane, S.C.

ROLL CALL

A formal roll call confirmed members present as stated above.

MINUTES

November 11, 2004

Commissioner Howard requested a correction to the November 11, 2004, meeting minutes, on Page 2, second paragraph, first sentence that reads: people in the 20s and 20s...change the to their. Page 2, eighth paragraph, sentence that reads: "Commissioner Howard stated her observation is that because Sherwood Heights has big upscale housing and they have more options regarding what they can do with their lots and have more discretionary income." She further stated the intent was not to make that statement absolute.

Commissioner Howard made a motion to approve the minutes of the November 11, 2004 meeting as amended. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Johnson and passed unanimously 7-0.

PUBLIC HEARING/ACTION ITEMS

7-ZN-2004 OLPH Mission Church Certificate of Appropriateness – Request by OLPH on Miller Road and the Roman Catholic Church of Phoenix to repair, stabilize and restore the HP zoned property at 3821 N. Brown Avenue so they can reopen the building as a place of worship. The architect for the applicant is Don Ryden. The Commission will use the design guidelines in the approved Historic Preservation Plan to determine whether a Certificate of Appropriateness should be approved.

Ms. Abele presented this case as per the staff report. She requested the Commission discuss each of the elements that require approval and then identify the appropriate design guideline that would relate to the recommended treatment.

The Commission discussed the replacement of the existing roof and reviewed the roof plan.

Gloria Argueso stated that she is a member of the Old Adobe Restoration Committee and grant writer for the Arizona State Parks Heritage Grant. She reported the intent is to replace the roof historically. Ms. Abele noted that the existing metal roof materials are different than what was there historically.

The Commission discussed the bell tower and adobe walls. Ms. Argueso provided information on the original structure noting that it was built with adobe bricks that were harvested from a nearby farm on Brown Avenue and the Architect is repairing damaged adobe with similar adobe.

Commissioner Gonzales stated his only concern is not so much the details but to ensure there are adequate photos being taken, and adequate documentation is being done at this time, to enhance the ability of future generations to study the building and its construction.

The Commission discussed the repair of the wooden window frames. It was noted the same shape of the historic window openings would be maintained. It was also noted the original stained glass is being repaired and reinstalled in its original locations because it is a common feature in churches.

The Commission discussed the removal of the non-historic main entry and side doors. It was noted that Design Guideline No. 11 states: Consider restoring the main entry doors with doors of original appearance. It was also noted the original doors would most likely have been wood. The applicant did not find any photos of the original doors. The Commission discussed the proposed hardware on the replacement doors.

Commissioner Dallett stated that she felt Design Guideline No. 11 was not written well since the original appearance was unknown. Ms. Abele replied the Commission could revise the guidelines. Commissioner Dallett stated it would have been helpful to hear from the architect, Don Ryden with regard to his research. Ms. Abele commented that normally Mr. Ryden would be here but it was his wedding anniversary. The consensus was that what is proposed meets the spirit of the guideline for doors and is a good solution.

The Commission discussed the miscellaneous items. Commissioner Johnson inquired about the type of rain gutters. Ms. Abele explained that a potential issue with the downspouts is that the City of Scottsdale does not allow exposed rain gutters and historically that is what was there. Mr. Meserve explained the rain gutters are important to preserve the adobe walls and foundation. It was noted that half-round rain gutters with round copper down spouts would be the most appropriate.

Chair Wimmer opened public testimony.

Sister Alice Ruane stated that she is the Assistant to the Pastor at OLPH and attended most of the committee meetings. She further stated that the committee wanted to find photos of what the entrance doors looked like in the early '30's. They did not find early photo and the committee came up with the idea of a wooden door with some handcrafted hardware. She commented with regard to the rain gutters, there were not rain gutters as we know them today but the idea is to have them to protect the building.

Gloria Argueso reported that the Arizona State Parks has approached her about applying for a second grant for phase 2 and the only way they can is if 70 percent of the work has been completed by March 30, 2005.

Chair Wimmer closed public testimony.

Commissioner Winslow stated that he felt that even though the rain gutters are not original they are appropriate. Mr. Meserve explained, with the photos in the HP Plan, that the south side of the building is where the rain gutters would occur and that this narrow side yard is not seen from the street because of the existing building on the property line to the south.

Commissioner Gonzales stated that he would have preferred to have a presentation from the architect. Ms. Abele replied the architect would be present on future cases but this case is mostly a training project.

Commissioner Winslow recommended that case 7-ZN-2004 be approved as submitted because of the conformance to the design guidelines 1 and 5 through 11 with the following stipulations: The roof gutter is of simple design and constructed of copper and information is presented to staff that this is the case.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner Dallett and passed unanimously 7-0.

Initiation of HP Overlay Zoning Cases for One or More of the Top Five 1950's Neighborhoods Under Consideration Including Cavalier Vista 3 & 4, Scottsdale Estates 4, Town & Country Scottsdale, Village Grove 1-6, and Sherwood Heights

The Commissioners' shared their impressions on the recent neighborhood meetings conducted with the 1950s neighborhood eligible for consideration for Historic District Designation. It was noted that the majority of the comments were positive and there seems to be broad neighborhood support with the exception of some residents in Sherwood Heights.

Mr. Meserve distributed copies of a letter staff received from Howard and Catherine Baldwin that indicated they did not think the designation for Sherwood Heights was right for the neighborhood. Ms. Abele stated she contacted the legal department and the lawsuit is still pending regarding the height overlay in Sherwood Heights.

Commissioner Johnson stated that she felt all five neighborhoods are worthy of being considered for historic district recognition. The consensus was that they should move forward. Ms. Abele reviewed the process for moving forward with the designation and suggested taking a tiered approach and initially moving forward with two neighborhoods. It was suggested that residents from all five neighborhoods could be invited to any public meetings as a chance to educate them on the process.

The consensus of the Commission was to start with two neighborhoods and stagger the process noting that all five neighborhoods are still under consideration. It was noted that some Sherwood Heights residents are resistant to the historic designation.

Commissioner Dallett moved to initiate HP overlay zoning cases for two neighborhoods, Town & Country Scottsdale and Village Grove 1-6. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Winslow and passed unanimously 7-0.

It was noted for the record that the other three neighborhoods are still under consideration; Scottsdale Estates 4, Cavalier Vista 3 and 4, and Sherwood Heights. Staff will proceed with taking the necessary steps for these first two City-initiated HP overlay zoning cases for neighborhood historic districts to move forward and potentially come back to the Commission for a public hearing in February 2005.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

Historic Register

Commissioner Howard reported the committee took a walking tour of the multi-family housing complexes in the Valley Ho District area on Saturday, November 13th. A lot of the units were theme related.

Education Outreach

Commissioner Hartz reported the Education Outreach Committee met on Monday of this week and reviewed what we accomplished this year. He further reported the committee brainstormed ideas for 2005.

Annual January Retreat on 2004 Work Program

Ms. Abele stated the retreat is tentatively scheduled for Saturday, January 29th, from 9 to 1 p.m. at the Cattletrack Complex.

Chair Wimmer stated that it would be helpful at the retreat for the Commissioners' to receive guidance on making motions and do some role-playing to improve the motion making process.

Commissioner Dallett suggested having someone from the Green Building program present information on how the HPC can work with that program.

Commissioner Gonzales stated we always run out of time so he would suggest the retreat is more of a working meeting and not take tours. Mr. Meserve suggested if anyone would like a tour of the Cattle Track Complex they can take a tour after the retreat.

HPO/STAFF REPORT AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Mr. Meserve reported the Commission would probably be reviewing a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Arsenic Facility on Miller Road, zoned HP, at the January meeting. Ms. Abele stated the issues regarding the Arsenic Facility are complicated.

Mr. Meserve passed out copies of the written summary of what has been done on archaeology in 2004. He also noted that Scottsdale may use the same forms to record petroglyphs that were used in South Mountain Park by Phoenix and he gave copies of these forms to Commissioner Johnson.

COMMISSION COMMENTS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Commissioner Johnson requested an update on the East Valley Coalition. Chair Wimmer stated that the Commission had previously determined we have withdrawn from any formal coalition and would provide support or share information to other cities when requested.

FUTURE MEETINGS AND AGENDA ITEMS

Ms. Abele stated the next regular meeting would be held on January 13, 2005.

Meeting adjourned at 7:00 p.m.

Submitted by:

For the Record Court Reporters